

- Wayne Arnold: Alright. Good evening folks. I'm Wayne Arnold. We're going to go ahead and start the neighborhood information meeting. This is for, uh, the project that's located at the Goodlette and Pine Ridge Road. It's the Pine Ridge Commons Shopping Center, also known as Magnolia Square. And it's also a conference plan amendment that covers the same 31 acre parent parcel.
- Wayne Arnold: We were, uh, in this process a little over a year ago and we're having to repeat the process because it's taken us a little bit more than a year to do the conference plan amendment and, uh, the rezoning. And, uh, so that's why we're back again.
- Wayne Arnold: If you received a notice and attended about a year ago, then this is round two. Nothing much has changed since then. But if you're new to it, I'm going to go through and tell you a little bit about what we're proposing to do. And if you have any, answer any questions.
- Wayne Arnold: Uh, the property, I'm sure most of you realize it's been partially developed with an office building, shopping center, retail. It's part of a commercial sub-districting the county's comprehensive plan that allows only commercial. We're proposing to amend that to allow 375 multi-family rental apartments on the property. And the language in the planning is also going to restrict us to a maximum of four stories of apartments for those buildings.
- Wayne Arnold: So that's really the biggest changes adding the residential component for the commercial sub-districting for the conference plan. And then, the planning that developed in zoning this in place right now allows 275 thousand square feet of retail and office development.
- Wayne Arnold: Obviously, the property goes north of Panther Lane and where the signalized intersection is. None of that's changing.
- Wayne Arnold: What we're proposing to change on the-the right over here, this is the existing master point. It depicts commercial and parking areas throughout the property and this is Panther Lane, Goodlette-Frank Road and Pine Ridge Road.
- Wayne Arnold: Uh, our proposed amendment will add some designations that allow for there to be residential on these three parcels. So, this is where the retail strip center sits today. This is behind the Raymond James Building and then this commercial out-parcel that's undeveloped today on Goodlette-Frank Road. And we're proposing to allow the residential component to be built-
- Richard Yovanovich: It's two parcels.
- Wayne Arnold: Oh, I'm sorry. There's two parcels. I'm sorry. It's this one and this one, right? What did I say?
- Richard Yovanovich: You said-

Wayne Arnold: This one too, I'm sorry. Correct that. It's where the existing shopping center is and the vacant out-parcel. Those are the two parcels where we're proposing to allow the residential dwelling units.

Wayne Arnold: So the PUD has been amended to reflect the insertion of residential development standards. Uh, after the first neighborhood information meeting we heard there was concern from some of our neighbors to the south about sight lines. So we've added a condition in the PUD document that restricts no residential building within the south 350 feet of our project. So that residential buildings would have to start essentially behind the out-parcels that are existing on Pine Ridge Road. So that's the closest that those buildings would be to the south property boundary.

Wayne Arnold: And, uh, again, we have, um, prepared traffic analyses, we've done a market analysis that says there's still a demand for a residential rental community in the area. And, um, we've been working with staff. We had the plan amendment transmitted to the State of Florida. It came back with no comments. And now the zoning is catching up with the comp-plan process. We have our first Planning Commission hearing for both the PUD and the adoption of the plan amendment on June 21st. Can somebody help me with the July date for the Board?

Sue: July 11th

Wayne Arnold: 11th? Thank you Sue. And that's when the Board would take potentially final action on both the PUD amendment and the comprehensive plan amendment. In a nutshell, that's kind of what we're proposing. I mean, I can try to share-

Richard Yovanovich: Did-did you mention in the [inaudible 00:03:47] that we're adding the commercial, but we have to reduce residential and [crosstalk 00:03:49].

Wayne Arnold: I'm sorry, but we have ... one of the things we did do too, and-and after our first neighborhood information meeting, we decided to add a conversion factor.

Wayne Arnold: So, for every residential unit that gets constructed in a project we have to give up 200 square feet of retail-commercial uses. So the 275 thousand square feet that are approved today, would be reduced correspondingly if we build the residential component. At present it's an option. We didn't say we're giving up X number of square feet, but likely to build it we'd have to tear down some of the existing shopping center, etc. so we're going to give up square footage of-of the retail-commercial in order to get the residential. And that's 200 square foot per unit conversion factor.

Sue: I want to apologize, it's July 10th.

Wayne Arnold: July 10th is the corrected BCC date. Sorry.

Sue: Sorry about that.

Sharon: Make sure they state their name please.

Wayne Arnold: When, in just a minute we'll go ahead and open up questions. But the court reporter ... we have these transcribed ... if you could state your name so the court reporter can indicate who's talking. The Planning Commission members have not really liked it when it just says 'unnamed person' because they don't really know if it's somebody from the developer's team or not.

Wayne Arnold: Let me introduce folks who are here to answer questions if we have 'em.

Wayne Arnold: David Genson, Barron Collier Companies.

Wayne Arnold: Rich Yovanovich is our Land Use Council, working on it.

Wayne Arnold: This is Sharon, working up in my office, recording the meeting.

Wayne Arnold: And, I think in a nutshell, those are kind of our changes.

David G.: Sue? And Parker?

Wayne Arnold: What's that?

Wayne Arnold: Oh, Parker Arnold who's with Barron Collier Company, who's interning. This is his first neighborhood information meeting.

David G.: Sue.

Wayne Arnold: Oh, and this is, from staff, we have Sue Faulkner. She's with our conference planning staff. And Tim Finn, so he'll be here from the Zoning Department. So they're the project managers from the county side.

Wayne Arnold: So with that, I think I'll turn it over to questions. If you have any. Make sure you state your name and speak loudly so we can record it.

Wayne Arnold: Yes sir.

Al Jones: Can you tell me what's the average, uh, retail space that you'd be, uh, giving up for [inaudible 00:05:46]?

Wayne Arnold: I'm not sure I understand [inaudible 00:05:48].

Al Jones: You said you were going to exchange, um, commercial area for residential area.

Wayne Arnold: Yes. The commercial package is 200 square feet of retail for each unit.

Al Jones: Okay you get ... what's your average profit going to be?

Wayne Arnold: What were asking for a minimum square foot size of seven hundred square feet. There will be a variety of sizes, but seven hundred will be-

Al Jones: If you take the typical, uh, commercial space that you're going to be exchanging, what's the typical commercial space that you have over there?

Wayne Arnold: David, do you ... ? I don't really know.

David G.: It varies.

Wayne Arnold: It varies. Yeah.

David G.: I mean, minimum's probably 1300 square feet.

Al Jones: I know it's going to vary, but-

David G.: 1300 square feet-

Sharon: One at a time.

David G.: Is probably the minimum, we're a single bay tenant.

Speaker 1: What did he say?

Wayne Arnold: He was saying there's about 1300 square feet is the smallest tenant space that in the shop in front of [inaudible 00:06:38]. If you do the math backwards, if we're doing 375 units times 200 square feet. Yeah, it's about 75 thousand square feet.

David G.: 75 thousand square feet.

Al Jones: [crosstalk 00:06:48] three or four. Uh, [inaudible 00:06:51]. Three or four apartments, you're likely to have 12 to 15 people.

Wayne Arnold: That varies. They're going to have ...

Al Jones: (laughs) How do you, how do you plan to bring an entire city out to be able to [inaudible 00:07:05] residences in and out?

Wayne Arnold: Well, right now they have access directly to Pine Ridge Road and Goodlette-Frank Road.

Al Jones: Really, coming out onto Pine Ridge Road and [inaudible 00:07:11] get into the right hand turn lane there.

Wayne Arnold: That is an exit to the shopping center there.

Al Jones: It's an exit, but-

Wayne Arnold: I mean, it's existing today.

Al Jones: If you come down Pine Ridge Road and you go to make a right on Goodlette-Frank during rush hour, you're up in traffic. If you happen to be coming out of your new residences coming into that, where are you going to go?

Wayne Arnold: I don't know. We're using existing access points, [inaudible 00:07:36] none of the access points-

Al Jones: Existing, but you don't have anybody in there now.

Wayne Arnold: But, we have been building for 275 thousand square feet of rental space.

Al Jones: Right, and you're going to add them on to the existing road which is already inadequate- already overburdened.

Wayne Arnold: I'm gonna-

Sharon: Wayne, Wayne, what was your name sir?

Wayne Arnold: What is your name?

Al Jones: Al Jones

Wayne Arnold: Al Jones.

Sharon: Thank you

Wayne Arnold: Okay.

Al Jones: And we'll also be coming out of Pine Ridge Estates onto Goodlette. And it's already a hassle getting out there in the morning because now if you're gonna go north, you gotta come down and make the U-turn, now you're gonna add traffic onto that coming out of there?

Wayne Arnold: Well that would mean we have access. We can't [inaudible 00:08:16] a signalized intersection.

Al Jones: Oh, but that-that's not going to bother the kids going in and out of the school?

Wayne Arnold: Mm.

- Al Jones: I mean, you've got a really bad situation. Well, traffic-wise at least. Just the number of other [inaudible 00:08:27] is just the traffic is awful.
- Caroline M.: So, uh, Caroline [Motino 00:08:31] from Pine Ridge. And I'd like to add to what Al just said. Coming out from the south of your plan there onto Pine Ridge Road, as you said you're coming off a turn lane, and it's not unusual to try and get across and onto the traffic light so you can turn south on Goodlette. And I cannot even imagine what that's going to look like.
- Caroline M.: Let alone people just try, because it's very short. If you've driven it, and I [inaudible 00:08:56] you to drive it, then you'll understand what we're talking about. I drive it because I come out of picking up the Starbucks and then, uh, trying to turn south on Goodlette and it is not easy. And that's one part. That's not the serious part. Panther Lane, as we all know, you should know, is actually a school lane, is actually a school access. It's not meant for the residential development to push out traffic at the traffic light which is the only sensible other departure if you want to go south on Goodlette. You have to turn out onto, down south on Goodlette that way.
- Caroline M.: Um, coming out, the only easy access you've got is turning north on Goodlette on that, uh, first, on the southerly Goodlette [crosstalk 00:09:44]. And again, I encourage everyone in this room to actually drive these options and see how you like it during a regular rush hour period.
- Caroline M.: Then you've got the, um, what we're concerned about in Pine Ridge coming out of the south end of Pine Ridge and trying to get onto the [crosstalk 00:10:01] and go north. We're already teaming with an intersection with [inaudible 00:10:07] made into a U-turn. But we are, uh, constantly, constantly dealing with traffic coming north on Goodlette and at the same time, usually, either the Ridge school, including the high school now because they're doing really well so they're letting more kids in, or church on Sunday, we've got constant traffic issues just trying to make a U-turn to go to a simple north turn on-onto Goodlette-Frank.
- Caroline M.: To go to the airport or something like that. Or to go anywhere. So, imagine what it's going to be like adding in these extra cars, 375 units you said?
- Wayne Arnold: Correct. 375 units.
- Caroline M.: And then the conversion is an option to change more, uh, specs, correct? Is that right?
- Wayne Arnold: No.
- Caroline M.: To add more units-
- Wayne Arnold: To add one single unit, I have to give up 200 square feet of retail space.

- Caroline M.: No, I understand that. But you, the-the plan isn't you personally. But the plan is to build these 375 units on the green space available, just back of Panther Lane, uh, abutting directly on Goodlette. And then taking away some commercial space, is that correct?
- Wayne Arnold: That's correct.
- Caroline M.: South of Panther Lane. But, if you-if you then took away additional commercial space you could add another four units, is that right? For example, if you happen to have an average of 1300 square foot for commercial space, you could add another four units, is that right? Is that the way-
- Wayne Arnold: The math, no. It really doesn't work that way. We're gonna build, if they build the residential component, the residential builder, and Barron Collier Companies will joint venture to build an apartment complex. That apartment complex, in order to fit it there, you're going to have to displace a good part of the existing strip shopping center that's there. So a good portion of the shopping center, and in fact to build all of what they want, they have to give up 75 thousand square feet of commercial space in order to build 375 units with the conversion factor.
- Caroline M.: Is that-is that [crosstalk 00:12:01]
- Speaker 2: [crosstalk 00:12:01]
- Wayne Arnold: Excuse me! One at a time please. And you need to state your name for the record.
- Caroline M.: Is that existing commercial space or is that commercial space that is zoned and not yet built on as in that green space?
- Wayne Arnold: It includes both.
- Caroline M.: Okay. So it's actually not taking away only buildings that are there, it includes giving up space that has not been built on which was [inaudible 00:12:20], correct?
- Wayne Arnold: That's correct. Yep.
- Caroline M.: Okay. So my next question-
- Wayne Arnold: Okay, can we-
- Caroline M.: That's okay, go ahead.
- Wayne Arnold: Okay. I was just going to say we have several people who've had their hands up.

Caroline M.: No, no, no. I just need to follow up, finish this thought. So you build your 375 units and I have an issue with height as well which I'll come back to after everybody else has a chance to ask a question. Um, you build your 375 units, but you have a conversion option so then you decide, "No, we'd like to put in units on the rest of it. I'll just take out the rest of my commercial space and I'll put up a extra housing unit. What's to stop doing that if that's the conversion, if the conversion's allowed there's nothing to stop from later on-

Wayne Arnold: The maximum [crosstalk 00:12:57]-

Caroline M.: [crosstalk 00:12:57]

Wayne Arnold: The maximum allowable units, under the PUD amendment that we're asking for right now, is 375 units. If we wanted to do more at some point in the future, we'd have to go through the same process that we're going through right now.

Caroline M.: But you've got this conversion option-

Wayne Arnold: It doesn't make a difference, ma'am-

Caroline M.: I don't understand how that's [crosstalk 00:13:13] but not [crosstalk 00:13:13]-

Wayne Arnold: The-there's a cap. There's a cap. And so we can't do anything above that cap of 375 unless we amend our PUD again. So-

Caroline M.: So forgive me for sounding stupid, but why do you put the conversion option in then? If 375 means 375, why bother mentioning and then we'll convert some extra if we want to?

Wayne Arnold: This is Wayne Arnold for the record again. The reason is because we don't want to imply that we're building 275 thousand square feet of retail-commercial and 375 units.

Richard Yovanovich: This is Rich Yovanovich, for the record. The-the county requires in PUDs that you include a trip-cap for peak hour trips when you get a Plan Unit Development ordinance approved. So in our PUD will be a trip-cap based upon the already approved 275 thousand square feet of commercial. So that will be our maximum peak hour trips we're allowed to have. The conversion factor that we're doing, the 200 square feet, per unit ... equates the 200 square feet of commercial for each residential unit equates to the same peak hour trips. So the- the way this project will work is it will be transportation neutral from what's already approved today during the peak hour analysis as if we had built the full, or actually maximized out what's already approved in the PUD. So it's the 375 minus 200 square feet per unit is a transportation neutral peak hour trip calculation.

Caroline M.: [crosstalk 00:14:54] asking about?

Richard Yovanovich: But you asked why we're not simply adding the 375. Is we're not adding the 375 without the conversion-

Caroline M.: No, you must have mis-heard my question.

Richard Yovanovich: No, no I don't think-

Caroline M.: My question was, why say 375 and, by the way, we can also have the conversion if we need it?

Wayne Arnold: No.

Richard Yovanovich: We say, in order to build the 375 we must deduct 200 square feet for each apartment from the 275. So if you do the math-

Caroline M.: No, no, no, no. Okay, again, not understanding my question.

Richard Yovanovich: I think I am. I've answered you're question.

Caroline M.: I understand you want to build, not you again personally, but want to build 375 units-

Richard Yovanovich: Correct.

Caroline M.: By building on the green space that was already zoned for commercial. And taking away some of the businesses-

Richard Yovanovich: Correct.

Caroline M.: And building there. My question is, there will still be businesses there-

Richard Yovanovich: Cor-

Caroline M.: There will be businesses that will have been left there-

Richard Yovanovich: Correct.

Caroline M.: I don't want to belabor this, it's really pretty simple, I think I'm good at communicating, apparently not. So, you still have businesses there-

Richard Yovanovich: Yes.

Caroline M.: What's to stop with this, "And by the way we can convert." What's to stop, at a later date, you invoking the conversion rule to say we want to knock down the rest of the buildings, uh, the businesses and it's more, uh, commercially-

Richard Yovanovich: I can't-

Caroline M.: What's more attractive to us to put in apartments?

Richard Yovanovich: I can't go above 375 apartment units regardless of the conversion.

Caroline M.: But then you don't need the conversion thing in there at all.

Richard Yovanovich: I can't go above 375. I do need-

Caroline M.: [crosstalk 00:16:32]

Richard Yovanovich: Well, they, maybe, no [crosstalk 00:16:36] communicate-

Wayne Arnold: Can we, maybe we can-

Caroline M.: Well we can move on-

Wayne Arnold: I think you ... right.

Caroline M.: But-but you understand my point, right?

David G.: No.

Wayne Arnold: No.

Richard Yovanovich: I don't understand your point.

Wayne Arnold: We should-

Caroline M.: Why have it if you don't intend at some future date to use it?

Wayne Arnold: We are, we have to-

Richard Yovanovich: To assure the community that we remain transportation neutral is why we have the conversion formula. That's why it's in there.

Caroline M.: I don't understand what, the conversion formula was used to [inaudible 00:16:57]?

Richard Yovanovich: Right.

Wayne Arnold: Correct.

Caroline M.: And I don't understand why it's in there. It sounds like some pretty fancy footwork to me, but-

Wayne Arnold: It's not. I can assure you it's not. Yes sir, you've had your hand up a long time.

James P.: Uh, thank you. My name's James [Payer 00:17:09] and I live on Caribbean Road. And, uh, I'm just kind of curious to know, you-your, the apartments that you're looking to build they're going to be separate units, they're not necessarily what you've done or what has been done at Mercato where there's residential above the commercial? Do you have the design plan for that?

Wayne Arnold: Dave, do you want to answer that?

Speaker 3: [inaudible 00:17:31], again.

Wayne Arnold: David

David G.: This is David Genson, Barron Collier. Uh, we have sev-several ideas that we've been looking at. It hasn't been necessarily a mixed use development like Mercato is. Mixed always brings in, um, some issues with respect to that kind of development. Uh, we've mostly looked at this right now as just a stand alone apartment unit complex. Um, not with a mixed use.

James P.: It's possible you could go to that conversion?

David G.: Yeah. We could do it, sure.

James P.: Now, question. You said 75 thousand, um, feet. How many acres is 75 thousand feet.

Wayne Arnold: No, the conversion factor, if you take all ... this is Wayne Arnold by the way ... the 375 units at the maximum conversion of 200 square feet per commercial space gets us to 75 thousand square feet of commercial that has to be reduced out of the ... what could be built in the PUD.

James P.: How many acres would that be?

Richard Yovanovich: Six hundred and two.

James P.: Six hundred two acres of the 35 proposed?

Wayne Arnold: Mm. Not necessarily. That's not the way you deal with commercial.

James P.: Okay.

Wayne Arnold: That's the volume of square feet that would be in the-the commercial space.

James P.: My-my concern is the traffic patterns that are here. And reluctant on two sections of in-in Pine Ridge Estates. We've got Goodlette-Frank that's out front here and we've got Pine Ridge that's, you know, to the west.

Speaker 4: And 41.

James P.: And 41. Excuse me. That's what I meant.

Speaker 4: So, we have a freeway.

James P.: Those are both extremely heavily trafficked roads and particularly doing this during the season. It's not like we have peak hours during the season. That's peak hours 'til 9:00 at night.

James P.: But the point is, is that those roads are not necessarily being maintained by the county to maintain roads. I mean, it's, I very much look at it, a lot of my friends consider it the Goodlette speedway. And you've got the dragster up on-on-on 41. It's like zero to 45 to 55 and rarely does anybody travel less than 60 on Goodlette. If you're coming out of, um, Bottom Woods where I lived just recently, to make a left hand turn you're taking your life in your hands there. It's I'm-it's impossible. And, um, you know, people are speeding.

James P.: And the amount of traffic, I mean if there's 375 units I'm going to guess that there's two cars in each household. And however you massage the PUD, I understand that, and the traffic. The traffic pattern really needs to take in to what's here now. And my opinion is, is that the county hasn't been able to demonstrate that they can manage the infrastructure that we have today. And particularly at this heavily congested area. And Irma was a perfect example of that. But, there you go.

James P.: And-and my other concern is that if you have all the options, you could have another Mercato where we have businesses that are open 'til two in the morning, people driving in and out, um, it's a heavily trafficked area. Mercato is not the smoothest parking spaces in the world either, so ... well [inaudible 00:20:37] I'll let everybody else speak. Thank you.

Wayne Arnold: Ed. Oh, I'm sorry. You have your hand ... I'm sorry, yes.

Shelly Z.: Shelly Zimmerman, Autumn Woods. Um, how long ago was this traffic study done?

Wayne Arnold: Um, you know I don't remember the date of the last update, but fairly recently. Um, in the last several months it was updated.

Shelly Z.: Okay, because I know they've had a bunch of traffic studies here at Collier, they're saying Pine Ridge can't handle the amount of traffic that's already there. They're talking about putting raised things like they have down at Goldengate to divert traffic and stuff already. So Pine Ridge is affected, Immokalee is affected, um, Collier County is actually talking about putting in these, uh, high road[inaudible 00:21:25]. And also, was a school study done?

Wayne Arnold: No.

- Shelly Z.: So whether or not our schools can handle the amount of students coming in from an apartment complex, which ...
- Wayne Arnold: So, this is Wayne, by the way for the record. And yes, uh, full traffic analysis was prepared and accepted by county staff to their methodology. And the school district is a part of every review that include residential development in Collier County and, uh, they've not issued any issue with the student population that would be generated from these apartments.
- Shelly Z.: I disagree. Because we are, you know, at capacity. Our school systems are at high capacity. Uh, you know, where we need to have low amounts of students, uh, now they're at the max with 20, 30 students in a classroom.
- Wayne Arnold: I-I can't speak for the school district, but they've reviewed our application.
- Wayne Arnold: Uh, Ed, back there.
- Ed Kant: My name's Ed Kant. I live up in Monterey. I just, I want to get it simple. I hear a lot of terms and jargon. But what I understand is that right now, today, you can build 275, up to 275 thousand square feet of commercial and office and what have you. Not residential. And that's going to generate X number of cars, peak hour. I realize that, in season, we have multiple peak hours. The point is that it's based on in season traffic. And then I further understand, from what I've heard, that if you want to put 375 apartment units in there, it's going to cost you 75 thousand square feet which is going to take and reduce your commercial, uh, and office down to 200 thousand square feet total.
- Ed Kant: So that, I believe Mr. Yovanovich said, that's going to be a traffic neutral. Now I realize that the words traffic neutral sound like an oxymoron, but in fact in doing the analyses it seems to me that what you've tried to do is to keep a zero impact based on what you already have improved, uh, approved. Not improved, approved.
- Ed Kant: So it seems to me that the discussions of whether this is going to generate more or less traffic are really moot because there is no discussion. If there's an issue with access on the Goodlette Road, if there's an issue with access onto Pine Ridge Road, then there's really a different forum where that needs to be addressed in at the county level. Because that's a- that's a master planning issue. This was already approved. The access points. You're not proposing any new access points. You're not proposing really any change in traffic pattern that I've been able to see. And so, I just, uh, I understand the concern, I mean the concern's right there today.
- Ed Kant: But if this project were built out as it is today, there is a potential for more traffic than what would occur if you made that conversion. Because I believe that traffic engineers will tell you that residential generates much less than commercial. And then you don't have a lot of control over what that conv-

which the county doesn't have a lot of control over that unless you have some cap on the number of square feets, the number of seats in restaurants, number of square feet of doctor's offices, these are high traffic generators. Uh, we see traff-, we see strip centers all the time, and they're those little stores one after the other and then all of a sudden it's one restaurant beside the other, you go up there, no parking. So I don't think you want to do that based on what I've seen of-of what Collier Companies have been doing.

Ed Kant: But it seems to me that-that we're spending an awful lot of time being concerned about traffic, when in fact, if this meeting wasn't being held and this project wasn't being proposed you'd still have the approval tomorrow to build 275 thousand square feet of commercial.

Richard Yovanovich: That's correct.

Ed Kant: Okay. To make sure I understand it.

Wayne Arnold: Yes sir.

Chris H.: Um, Chris [Holmswold 00:25:52], Pine Ridge resident. Just, property backs right into Goodlette across the street from this. Can you please tell, the Barron Collier person [crosstalk 00:26:03] first how many, what is occupancy rate, 'cause redemption by the [Solomon 00:26:08] Rules take commercial for seven years, what is the occupancy rate of this space you're talking about giving up. Can you please tell the audience what that occupancy rate is right now?

David G.: I don't know what the occupancy rate is. It's not very big.

Chris H.: Are you, we can walk over there right now and see all the empty space.

David G.: Sure.

Chris H.: There's how many square feet empty now, about 45 thousand?

David G.: Sure.

Chris H.: 48 thousand?

David G.: Sure.

Chris H.: So don't, you know, just let crowd know that the stakes are [inaudible 00:26:31]. It cannot rest. So they're not giving up much. That's number one. Number two, have you proposed this to the county as being a rent-subsidized space?

David G.: No sir.

Chris H.: Okay.

David G.: Market rate rentable apartments.

Chris H.: Market rate rentable apartments. Number three, the county is sitting right here taking through [inaudible 00:26:51] in their traffic plan that they're proposing a four story parking garage at Clam Pass Park, which is going to pull a tremendous amount of traffic not done in this traffic plan down Pine Ridge Road to Clam Pass Park. Which is not in that. Is that a part of the traffic plan?

David G.: It is not.

Chris H.: It is not. Thank you so, because it's-

David G.: Because that's not a proposed plan for the county.

Chris H.: No, it's, the county is spending two hundred thousand dollars, approved to study building the same garage at Vanderbilt, which you can't even drive down there or the beach is used to build the same parking down in Clam Pass. Down in Clam Pass.

Wayne Arnold: Well all I can say to that is, we're not going to wait for the county's studies on the parking garage that may or may not occur in the future. We're ready to go with residential project now.

Chris H.: There's 43 thousand square feet roughly in an acre? So how many units are going on each acre? How many units [crosstalk 00:27:52] on each acre?

Wayne Arnold: How many unit [crosstalk 00:27:55]. It's 375 divided by 31. That's our density.

Chris H.: No, that's not the question I asked. I'm a realtor [inaudible 00:28:01] full time.

Wayne Arnold: That's not the-

Chris H.: What is the, what is the [inaudible 00:28:03], the buffer [inaudible 00:28:07] and what is the density per acre?

Wayne Arnold: I don't have the answer for you tonight.

Chris H.: Your-you don't have the density per acre-

Wayne Arnold: I-

Chris H.: On a project like this.

Wayne Arnold: [crosstalk 00:28:12] the county calculates the density.

Chris H.: I would folks, I would, if you lived on an acre or two acres on [Pondue 00:28:17] and Pine Ridge wait until you hear the actual density per acre of this project. It's

nothing I've ever heard, and I lived in New York most of my life. But the density is going to be unbelievable.

Chris H.: And what you're not telling you about is the amount of additional traffic that will come into the development when people visit the people who live in the development. Don't forget that these are rental units, these are not permanent residences. So the transiency factor of this unit, this whole project will be quite high affecting us who live here permanently in this, in this area.

Richard Yovanovich: I dis- I disagree.

Chris H.: That's what I have to say.

Richard Yovanovich: Um, I'm gonna- I'm gonna say something. Uh, Rich Yovanovich for the record. Um, for one, I live in Pine Ridge, I've lived in Pine Ridge for almost 20 years, I've been in the traffic patterns about what's happened too. Everything you just said about traffic analyses is incorrect.

Richard Yovanovich: Traffic analyses are done based upon professional documents by in season-

Chris H.: At low season. At the low season.

Richard Yovanovich: That's where you're wrong. They've done that, they're done at the peak season. Sir, you don't know what you're talking about so I'm going to correct the record. Because what you said was incorrect.

Richard Yovanovich: We do analysis based on the peak season analysis, based upon professionally gathered data through the ITE which is the Institute of Traffic Engineers. Which factors in people who live in the residences as well as people who come and visit the residences. So, there is a professional analysis done by multiple professionals. How the professional [inaudible 00:29:55] is purely viewed by the county's professionals.

Richard Yovanovich: So the transportation analysis that we did to show what we're proposing is transportation equal that Mr. Cant has just said, if we were to fully use up the property which we can do. And which they have deliberately decided not to do because they're looking at the option of doing an apartment complex.

Chris H.: So, you say- [crosstalk 00:30:22].

Richard Yovanovich: So, when you're saying, excuse me. Excuse me, I'm going to interrupt you.

Chris H.: You are.

Richard Yovanovich: What's that?

Chris H.: You're a resident of Pine Ridge?

Richard Yovanovich: I absolutely am a resident of Pine Ridge.

Chris H.: So, you're not taking this just out of the character of the entire neighborhood?

Richard Yovanovich: I did not. If I did, I wouldn't be on the project.

Chris H.: 375 rental units.

Richard Yovanovich: I don't think it's out of character because I have to answer to a higher being and that's my wife. And when we're doing this project, I've looked at it, it doesn't affect the neighborhood, I drive that intersection every morning at the peak hour so I get to see each way. Coming home, I come up 41 so we'll keep an open trust thing going.

Richard Yovanovich: So I understand the traffic patterns and your statements are valid. The density on this project, I don't know what part of New York you're from, but I guarantee you this is not New York density. So this project is in keeping with Card Carrying. Card Copies has been around for a long time, they've done multiple market rate apartment complexes. It's going to be a nice apartment complex, it's not going to be a Mercato and it's a project that will fit in nicely with the Pine Ridge community and will not negatively impact the traffic that will [inaudible 00:31:29].

Speaker 5: Could you put that on the record-

Richard Yovanovich: We just did.

Speaker 5: That you did not intend this to be a Mercato with residential units above the commercial space?

Richard Yovanovich: Yes.

Wayne Arnold: Yes. I'll put that on the record.

Caroline M.: Mr. Yovanovich, you obviously do know about the traffic study and there was mention earlier of not knowing exactly what it concerned. But clearly you do know what it concerns-

Richard Yovanovich: I did-

Caroline M.: Yes, but just for the record, can you say that for everybody's information, that would be great. Thank you.

Richard Yovanovich: Two things you need to know about traffic stuff.

Caroline M.: No, no. Just [inaudible 00:31:55].

Richard Yovanovich: Just listen to me a minute please. The day you do the traffic study, they-they what you do is you use the traffic counts that peak season counts. So if I do a traffic study today I still use peak season numbers, so the data on the study doesn't indicate the volumes we use. We use traffic volumes on the roads during the peak hour. So I'm going to tell you a date that's actually prepared, but you need to understand it used counting peak hour trips.

Caroline M.: So, how are those calculated?

Richard Yovanovich: The county does trips routinely every year, and they're out there counting the traffic that's on the road and the ITE manual tells you peak hour trips.

Caroline M.: So, it says that it's December 21st multiplied by [crosstalk 00:32:41].

Richard Yovanovich: It tells you exactly how to do that. And I-

Chris H.: Is this ... All this information given on the internet?

Richard Yovanovich: Yes. [crosstalk 00:32:49]

Wayne Arnold: This is Wayne. All the information is available on colliercounty.gov website and it's also available on our website, isn't it Sharon? If you go to our planning tab

Sharon: Yes, we have a link to the county website.

Wayne Arnold: [crosstalk 00:33:00]. There's a link to the county's website on our GradyMinor.com website under planning.

Hal Jones: You know, in the, within the past two years-

Wayne Arnold: Could you say your name please for the record?

Hal Jones: They-they took a lane-

Sharon: You're going to have to say your name.

Wayne Arnold: Could you please say your name for the record?

Hal Jones: Hal Jones, from Pine Ridge, uh, in the last two years they took a lane from the westbound side on Pine Ridge Road at the intersection of 41. They took one of those lanes from the eastbound side, took it away and added it to the westbound side.

Hal Jones: There's nothing more you can do that intersection unless you wanna to get the drugstore to leveled and widen the turn or something. That's-that's at its maximum capacity right now. You bring more traffic down here and you'll never get through that intersection. Right now, in rush hour it's backed up.

Wayne Arnold: If I might, this is Wayne again, as Mr. Cant and others have stated, if we did nothing today, Barron Collier could lease out all of the existing space and continue to build more commercial square footage. They're approved and vested for that amount of square footage. They're willing to give up the commercial to trade it for the residential and it's traffic neutral. It generates no more trips.

Hal Jones: What we're saying is this. There's enough traffic on these two roads now with little or no use of that land. And you want to add 275 units, or 375 units in there. You're going to add that to what's already an unbearable problem.

Richard Yovanovich: For the record, Rich Yovanovich. The date of the traffic study is December 5th, 2017.

Caroline M.: Thank you very much.

Chris H.: Chris Hall speaking for the record. Your statement was hyper-speculation. I was on Loop Lenk Ness, LoopNet, LoopNet people go look in a commercial site. There's such a glut of space, not-not like industrial space, a glut of commercial space as our company's looking for some large space, and with that space is not, I repeat, not leaseable. There is, not leaseable. It's been there for quite awhile. If you go on LoopNet tonight, look up lease space and, uh, Naples, you'll see about one point three or whatever the number is, one point two million square feet of available Class B and A space and retail space available for lease.

Wayne Arnold: Who hasn't had a chance to ask a question? Yes ma'am?

Lindsay M.: I just have a question, um-

Wayne Arnold: Can you make sure you speak up a little?

Lindsay M.: Oh, sorry. Lindsay Murphy, um, Autumn Woods. Uh, going to the, you know there is a glut of [inaudible 00:35:29] apartments because it has retail and nobody wants it, right? So my-my concern is a couple things. The traffic, did the study propose any improvements? Or, I know it's neutral, but was there any improvements proposed with the traffic study? Like any turn lane, anything?

Richard Yovanovich: I don't believe so.

Wayne Arnold: No.

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Richard Yovanovich: The analysis was done with the existing improvements-

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Richard Yovanovich: In [inaudible 00:35:54].

Lindsay M.: Okay. The school, uh, capacity. I know you said that the, you know, that the school district can handle the additional students from 375. Do we know if it will impact any of the districts, the actual district lines? I mean, I've seen plenty of times where it puts us over the edge and the line changes. Do we know? Does the county know? Does the staff know? If that will change the school lines?

Wayne Arnold: Are you saying, causing, meaning like causing re-districting because of this? I'm not aware of that.

Lindsay M.: Yeah, for the school district.

Wayne Arnold: I'm not aware of that.

Richard Yovanovich: I don't know the ans-

Lindsay M.: Is that, is that something that's usually in the school report?

Richard Yovanovich: No, it's not. Because the school, the, what the school-

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Richard Yovanovich: For the record, Richard Yovanovich. Um, sorry about that, with the tape you have to [inaudible 00:36:30], uh, the school district periodically studies-

Lindsay M.: Right.

Richard Yovanovich: Where they-where they do that. So I don't think it's part of their analysis when a new project comes in. Do they look at how it could impact the re-districting?

Lindsay M.: But they look at per school. They don't just look at, "Okay, the overall district can accommodate X amount of children. There's space." Do they say-

Richard Yovanovich: They look at the schools-

Lindsay M.: They do the individual school.

Richard Yovanovich: Within their vicinity and then I think it's like an adjacent school for lack of a better example, just think about Sea Gate Elementary and what's the nearest elementary school to Seagate-Seagate-Sea Gate become too crowded.

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Richard Yovanovich: Same for Pine Ridge Middle and, um-

Caroline M.: But Sea Gate already has 25 children in one class.

Richard Yovanovich: The school district decides what's the appropriate school size. We don't decide that. The school district decides that and-and I think that the school-

Speaker 6: Maybe, maybe somebody else should come in and-

Wayne Arnold: Excuse me, one at a time please.

Lindsay M.: You still can meet us as staff if you can check with the school district to see if they have any of that kind of information by school to make sure how many students they're expecting to go to Sea Gate, Pine Ridge and Barron Collier.

Lindsay M.: Um, the other thing is, my overall kind of concern is you have the comp plan amendment, you have the rezoning, that's a, you know, a basic pod plan. The design of the project, I know you don't have all the fin- you've done this a million times, you have a lot of apartment complexes. Um, the height, you said four stories over parking.

Wayne Arnold: That's our maximum height.

Lindsay M.: Okay, so how many stories of parking?

Wayne Arnold: Seems, one.

Lindsay M.: So, a five story building.

Wayne Arnold: Four stories over one level of parking.

Lindsay M.: Okay. Um-

Richard Yovanovich: But, there's also a maximum height that goes along with that. That's zoned by, it's 55 feet so that includes the parking.

Lindsay M.: Okay. What was the maximum height when it was just the, uh, straight commercial PUD?

Wayne Arnold: It's got two different heights actually for the, it's got retail and office building heights.

Wayne Arnold: [inaudible 00:38:48]

Richard Yovanovich: Uh, retail height was 40 feet, office height is 50.

Lindsay M.: Okay. And the residential maximum would be what?

Wayne Arnold: 55.

Richard Yovanovich: 55.

Lindsay M.: Okay. Um, the buffers in the open space give the conversion from commercial to residential. What kind of, if you do the pod that's adjacent to Goodlette what kind of buffer will be seen and how deep and, or are there apartment buildings right up against the street?

Wayne Arnold: Well, there can be. There's a four [power 00:39:18] light easement that runs parallel to the road, which-

Lindsay M.: But you can't plant in those, so that's-

Wayne Arnold: Which we can plant low level vegetation. We just can't plant trees that are exceeding 14 feet in height.

Lindsay M.: Okay. So-

Wayne Arnold: There's still a buffer requirement-

Lindsay M.: But is that, how deep is that buffer?

Wayne Arnold: It's a 20 foot landscape buffer requirement that's required along Goodlette-Frank Road.

Lindsay M.: Whether it's residential or commercial?

Wayne Arnold: Correct.

Lindsay M.: Okay. Um, in the open space, is that compatible with the residential community?

Wayne Arnold: What's that question? I'm sorry.

Lindsay M.: What's the open space provided and what's required?

Wayne Arnold: The open space required for commercial development is 30 percent, and for mixed use is 30 percent, and-

Lindsay M.: It's the same?

Richard Yovanovich: Seriously.

Wayne Arnold: They stay the same. And the preservation areas are shown on the plan in a couple places and those are already recorded easements that have-

Lindsay M.: Does the preservation area stay the same?

Wayne Arnold: Yes. Yes.

Lindsay M.: Required?

Wayne Arnold: Yes.

Lindsay M.: So there should be no extra green space in a residential community?

Wayne Arnold: Well that's considered a mixed use planned development, and the standards for mixed use and commercial are very similar.

Lindsay M.: But essentially, when you're only putting residential in two of the pods and commercial on the north and the southwest corner, you have essentially, you know, a residential community and comm-or whatever, office, commercial. Um, I would like to know, if you, I know you can do the calculation what the net density is on the two pods that you're going to put the 375 on.

Richard Yovanovich: [inaudible 00:40:46] I don't really understand what [inaudible 00:40:43]

Wayne Arnold: A lot of that depends. Because the, uh, it would depend on how much of the shopping center would get demolished that's there today.

Lindsay M.: Assume you do the 375 and you keep whatever the balance is of your strip, that, you know the 200.

Wayne Arnold: Mm-hmm (affirmative)

Lindsay M.: If you take that, delineate the less, that acreage, put 375 units on it, what's the net density per acre?

Wayne Arnold: See if we can come up with a figure, I don't have that number right now, but-

Lindsay M.: Okay. I'd be curious to see-

Wayne Arnold: I see Dave is going for his calculator, so ...

Lindsay M.: What that is compared to other residential districts in the area.

Wayne Arnold: Okay. And we won't have a comparison for you, I'm sure to tell you what those are tonight. Yes, ma'am?

Shelly P.: Hi. Shelly [Pear 00:41:20] from Pine Ridge. Um, okay, so regarding this traffic study that was done in December, based on the current conditions in December, and for high season, right?

Richard Yovanovich: Yes.

Shelly P.: Okay. And you've already said that a lot of the commercial space in the existing development is vacant. And you're going to give up some of that commercial

space and you're going to add residential there. So how can it be traffic m-m-moot when you're going to add space that will be rented and take away space that isn't rented?

Richard Yovanovich: What-what-what, and this is, and I get your-your thought process. Your thought process is there's clearly going to be more traffic coming from this area than is that's being generated today because there's vacant space. We get that.

Richard Yovanovich: But you can't assume that this shopping center area is never going to be developed. That's an assumption you cannot make. It's already approved for 275 thousand square feet. So you have to assume that we are going to eventually lease up the entirety of the shopping center which is 275 thousand square feet. And there's a traffic calculation based upon peak hour trips of a shopping center and that's going to yield X peak hour trips. So what we're saying is, assume we going out there and we actively market and we eventually lease up the entirety of this project. We're going to get at this.

Richard Yovanovich: We're saying to you, we're going to reduce the office and retail a corresponding amount to the residential we're going to put in, so X stays the same. There's no question there's going to be more traffic than is generated today, it has to be. We have vacant land.

Richard Yovanovich: Forget about the space that hasn't been rented, but that's not the analysis. The county analysis is if the 275 thousand has actually been built and been leased, and it eventually will. Maybe not tomorrow, maybe not next year but eventually that center will be built and leased up.

Richard Yovanovich: So the choice it comes down to: traffic's the same, do you want to have commercial there or do you want to have an upscale apartment complex there? That's what we're proposing because we think there's definitely a need for apartments.

Richard Yovanovich: Now whoever hasn't gotten a chance, please you get to go first in the proper order.

Meryl: My name is Meryl [Poughkspie 00:44:05], I live in Autumn Woods. Um, you said there was a 30% open space requirement, so in this complex, 30% of the space is going to be open? Is that correct?

Wayne Arnold: It's applied across the entirety of the 31 acre PUD.

David G.: The application says-

Wayne Arnold: That's not how[crosstalk 00:44:22].

Pat N.: Pat- Pat Newman from Monterey. I think it would be helpful to tell everybody how much space right now is built out commercially so people understand what you were saying.

Richard Yovanovich: How many square feet are actually built today?

Pat N.: Exactly, right. Half of the 275.

Richard Yovanovich: What's that?

Pat N.: I think it's half.

Richard Yovanovich: Yeah. I couldn't remember what the engineer-

Pat N.: Okay. I think it's like a hundred-

Richard Yovanovich: We'll, we'll count up ro- we'll answer that question, he's doing that, we'll go on to this gentleman over here.

Speaker 7: Well, I've got several questions. First of all, I'm not sure December 5th is a peak season because a lot of people go up north for, uh, Thanksgiving and don't come back later, or leave for Christmas and really January, February, March are really more peak season than December. Uh, it's not really peak, it's-it's semi-peak. So, I would-would beg to differ with that, number one.

Speaker 7: Number two, uh, there's a fire station right in the area and anybody that drives around there, especially in season, knows what traffic there is at Pine Ridge and Goodlette-Frank and, uh, the fire station's very close to them and right next to this.

Speaker 7: I can't imagine that, uh, that cannot impede, that will not impede, uh, traffic, uh at times especially in season and minutes count in emergencies. Also, uh, I think it defies logic to pretend that there's not going to be a whole lot more traffic there than there is now. Studies notwithstanding and granted, you say that what we have now is not what's allowed under the existing 'pud'.

Speaker 7: But what happens when you get more traffic is people find ways to cut corners through non-gated communities. I live in Pine Ridge Estates, a non-gated community, and we already have some of that going on now especially in Lynch Drive which is kind of a mini-speedway at times. And, uh, that would just increase. A lot of people in Pine Ridge Estates have, uh, kids and, uh, there's no sidewalks except for the far northern part of Pine Ridge Estates and kids are around and that-that [inaudible 00:46:08] another safety hazard.

Speaker 7: So you've got a fire station that's, uh, very close to the intersection. And a highly packed area, and, you know how long it takes, the fire station has priority but you know when you've got a whole bunch of traffic it doesn't make any

difference. And uh, I see no negati- I see no positives in this for anybody in this room except for the developer. I mean, I see nothing but negatives for anybody else. And I think, I would daresay, most people would much rather have the full built up 275 thousand square feet of commercial space rather than 375 units. You call it upscale, I'm not sure what, uh, 700 square foot, uh, rental is upscale. There's nothing there about that that sounds upscale to me.

Speaker 7: Naples definition, maybe it's just you. But, I don't ... There's nothing positive for this community.

Richard Yovanovich: Couple things. Remember I told you the date that they write the report doesn't mean the date they actually did the traffic counts. The date the traffic count information in the report is peak season, peak hour trip analysis. The date of the report, which I said early on, is immaterial. So when you read the report, you will see they used the peak hour trip counts that the county has so-

Speaker 7: And what was the peak then that they used? They should have-

Richard Yovanovich: I have to go back and look at the report. I'm just telling you that when you go read the report it'll say, and Sue and Tim will tell you from the county, that's how it's done. So that analysis is done correctly.

Speaker 7: And what-

Richard Yovanovich: And I understand your [crosstalk 00:47:39] wasn't a question, it was a statement, that you think you would prefer the shopping center when it's fully occupied. And maybe you will and maybe you won't, but there's a lot of shopping centers out there that are 275 thousand square feet generating a whole lot of, generating a whole lot of traffic and there may be others who don't agree with you, that they'd rather have the traffic generated from the shopping center when it's the same traffic numbers.

Speaker 8: And what about the [crosstalk 00:48:04] five story shopping center?

Wayne Arnold: Excuse me sir! Can you please hold your comments?

Richard Yovanovich: I just said it's a matter of opinion. You're allowed to have one.

Speaker 8: In my backyard, I'm looking at five stories of buildings-

Wayne Arnold: Excuse me! Please! One at a time, and please state your name and wait until you're called upon please.

Speaker 7: What about the increased traffic through Pine Ridge Estates? Which is not a gated community which results from that?

- Richard Yovanovich: Well, then that could happen today when the shopping center gets increased. There are people coming through, I don't know how long you've been living in Pine Ridge but I remember when people were actually expanding Goodlette-Frank Road. The amount of people that were trying to avoid the intersection when they were doing all that work, coming through Center and going through the community to avoid that intersection then founded goodlettefrank.gov, the amount of cut through traffic reduced.
- Richard Yovanovich: You're gonna have cut through traffic in your community, regardless whether it's a shopping center or whether it's residential, people are going to cut through our community and hopefully people will pay attention to where the stop signs are because frankly a lot of people who live in our community don't pay attention to the stop signs on Ridge and just blow right through them. So we're going to have cut through traffic.
- Lucero M.: [Lucero 00:49:13] Martino. You mentioned, uh, people going out of Pine Ridge Estates onto Center, at Goodlette-Frank at Center, and if they want to go northbound they have to first go southbound, make a U-turn by the church area which is almost impossible in season as it is. Uh, and that'll just be totally imposs- I mean, you know, there'll be more accidents, or, that's bound to happen. I mean, that doesn't-that doesn't require statistics, that just requires common sense.
- Wayne Arnold: The gentleman in the back row hasn't had a chance to ask a question. Yes, sir?
- Tony D.: Hi. My name's Tony [Devorsey 00:49:41], I live in Pine Ridge. Um, you know, I hear a lot about the traffic, I'm not going to go there.
- Tony D.: What I'm concerned with is I have kids that go to Pine Ridge Middle School. And you have 375 rental units there with anybody with first, last and security can get in there.
- Tony D.: And I'm concerned because my daughter is 12 and her girlfriends walk to Starbucks after school sometimes. And now, they're going to be walking through a residential apartment complex that you guys say is upscale. What's upscale? I mean we live in, most of us live in multi-million dollar homes. In Pine Ridge, we moved there, I just built a house there to be in a nice neighborhood in a nice community and now we're going to have 375 rentals across the street. Right in front of the school, [inaudible 00:50:26] two schools. It's just, you know, I'm concerned with, concerned with safety for my kids ...
- Richard Yovanovich: I don't know if you know what the market rate is in Collier County for one bedroom apartments right now.
- Tony D.: 13, 14, 15 hundred bucks?

Richard Yovanovich: I don't think that, that's going to be a lower class type of individual that's going to live in a one bedroom apartment and that's paying 13 hundred dollars a month to live there.

Speaker 9: Watching your daughter go to school every day.

Richard Yovanovich: Yes, ma'am

Cindy P.: Cindy Pesani, um-

Tony D.: Weirdos might have money.

Richard Yovanovich: Well, I'm sure there's probably some weirdos living in our community. (laughs)

Tony D.: You're probably right. But-

Cindy P.: Um, I live in Northgate Village, and we have, and I work for a CPA firm. We've got some of our young staff that are living in 13 hundred dollar apartments. And they're not getting paid that much. That's high, that's, you know, that is as cheap as they can find for a one bedroom.

Richard Yovanovich: I'm assuming your, they're professional staff.

Cindy P.: Yeah. Yeah, exactly. Um, you previously had mentioned that you had some other options for this property but it, kind of getting the feeling that you, that that's, your all set to go with this.

Wayne Arnold: Well, it's clearly an option of development. David's had people looking at retail space in the last several months. So it's not as if we're ready to and expecting to break ground on this, but it is a realistic expectation because there's a strong interest in apartment rental communities right now and this makes a lot of sense business wise for them. But retail also may make business sense for them.

David G.: Yeah. For the record, David Genson. I'll just that, you know, we only brought this in as an option and we're continuing to look at commercial opportunities on these properties as well. One of the things that was mis-stated about our-our vacant spaces is that we can't lease it. Well we can't because SweetBay still leases it and they pay us their lease. And our lease, their lease with it precludes us from going out and trying to market it for them. So the fact that it's sitting there vacant is not necessarily any cause of cost, it's called SweetBay. But they're still paying us. They've been paying us for-for seven, eight years is that's been vacant. So I just wanted to correct that.

David G.: But we also had other people. Like we had a car dealership look at it. We had an ALF look at it.

Cindy P.: What's that?

David G.: You know, there are several options. Assisted living, sorry.

Cindy P.: Okay.

David G.: There are several options that are out there. We're not, I'm telling you right now, today, that I can't say with any degree of certainty that it is going to be residential. Because [inaudible 00:53:19] could come walk in the door tomorrow and say we want to take the SweetBay space. Great, here you go, let's go.

Cindy P.: That sounds ...

David G.: You know, the fact was, give us some flexibility, uh, with this, with this property, and that's it. We don't have any deals that are inked, if you will.

Wayne Arnold: Who hasn't had a chance yet?

Greg D.: Hi. Uh, Greg [Delasente 00:53:48], NT with Northgate Village. Uh, David, just a quick follow up on that. Do-do you know off the top of your head how many more years on your lease that you have over there at SweetBay?

David G.: Fifte-, no, nine years, I'm sorry. Nine years.

Greg D.: Nine years remaining?

David G.: Yeah.

Greg D.: Okay.

Sue: Wow...

Speaker 10: Why would they do that, just a question?

Wayne Arnold: The question is why would SweetBay continue to do that?

Speaker 10: Yeah, I just, you know, I'm trying to figure out why they would lock that up.

Wayne Arnold: Well, one they don't have a choice. Under their lease agreement it was for a certain period of time.

David G.: There's a significant, you know, if they cancel the lease, there's some significant penalties to do that.

James M.: James Mayer. And back to the traffic study, which I ... that's my biggest concern is, well actually my biggest concern is the quality of life that we have in this area now and getting more congestion makes you wonder how that's going to happen. But, if, let's take SweetBay, was that put into the traffic study that if

SweetBay were up and operating, what would they generate. If it was a Publix, or whatever, what kind of ... Was that added into the traffic study?

Wayne Arnold: This is Wayne by the way. The county transportation study analyzed that there was going to be 275 thousand square feet of commercial uses and made an assumption for how much would be office and how much would be commercial shopping center. The Institute for Traffic Engineers has land use codes for almost every use you can imagine. One is a shopping center. And then there's medical office, general office, etc. And then they take those and look at the square footages and that converts to a number of trips per peak hour. And that's what gets put into the model.

James M.: And-and that's a formula, that's a formula that they work by. But if you live here and you experience these intersections and the traffic that's on the road, that formula is-is not applicable to the existing space and our quality of life.

Wayne Arnold: Well, I guess I-I liken that sir, to, you know, the people who, you don't build the church parking lot for Easter Sunday. Because, you know, the ITE standards are based on averages around the country. They collect data. And for the longest time, like a racetrack gas station was the anomaly. The latest round of the ITE standards finally have included those large volume gas pump stores as part of their analysis. Because before, you were using a code that was based on, you know, some of the old mom and pop things.

James M.: Right.

Wayne Arnold: So, I mean, there are, these standards evolve and they look at them every year or two and upgrade those standards.

James M.: So, so we assume that you are able to satisfy the county's requirements for the traffic patterns with your traffic studies, which makes it probably a done deal. I don't know if the county can say no to any development anymore today when you look around. And looking at the count- what the county can do to provide for the infrastructure that we have.

James M.: I-I just don't, I don't understand. Irma was the perfect example. I mean, our pumping sewage into the canals for weeks because we didn't have generators at our, you know, at our back up stations. It's-it's just, at what point do we not say, or at what point can the county say, "No."

Wayne Arnold: Well the county has level of service standards for many, many things they consider Class A facilities. And that includes everything from water and sewer and roads, parks and recreation facilities, sheriff, police, fire. So, you know, they look at those every year. It's called-

James M.: And there's no better group out there than Collier. I mean they have been, they have been good people in a number of areas throughout [inaudible 00:57:16].

But it just seems that the edge of the county where it wraps around the city, where the city has a referendum that was passed that's being ignored now for heights of buildings- which is not anywhere near 55 feet- but it seems like right on the edge of the city here from Goodlette down south, that-that whole complex that's in there, I think that's a Collier project too, is it not?

Richard Yovanovich: Which?

James M.: The, um, right at the end of Goodlette before, where 41 makes the turn. What is that? 10th Street right in there?

Wayne Arnold: No. That's not-

David G.: That's not our project.

Richard Yovanovich: That's not-the condo project that's going up right there?

David G.: That's [Rosco 00:57:50]

Richard Yovanovich: That's [Ronto 00:57:50] who's doing that.

Wayne Arnold: Naples [inaudible 00:57:53]

Richard Yovanovich: Yeah, that's Ronto.

James M.: Well, I guess that's the point of view. Naples was when, Shelly grew up here in 1963, and it was a sleepy little village. We're losing the whole idea of what is Naples. And the City of Naples and the county, which is all of Naples, is the quality of life. It just keeps growing. Are we going to be satisfied when we're Fort Lauderdale all the way up, you know Hollywood up to Palm Beach where it's just, we don't even have 95 here. 75 is-is it. And 41 and Goodlette are being used as main intersections that are being traveled at 65 to 75 miles an hour regularly. So, I mean, whatever you do, I hope you can take into consideration the overall impact of what's going on.

Wayne Arnold: Ma'am.

Shelly Z.: Okay. Shelly Zimmerman, uh, Autumn Woods. About the traffic study again. Maybe it's too lenient from the county. Is the proposed traffic study for Livingston and Pine Ridge with, have they passed that, do you know, to put-

Sue Faulkner: I'm not aware of it. I don't work in Transportation [inaudible 00:59:09]. I work in the field-

Shelly Z.: Anybody know?

Shelly Z.: For Pine Ridge and Livingston, they were talking over by the vineyards. About putting one of the overpass bridges to relieve some of the traffic that's on Pine Ridge. Ah, maybe it was at that meeting six months ago. And they had proposed that they are trying to do that at the Pine Ridge-Livingston and also at the Immokalee-Livingston where they're putting, because there's so much traffic coming down Pine Ridge they're trying to divert it other areas.

Sue Faulkner: If you'd like, I can give you the name of the manager for Transportation Planning for the county. Um, that would be the department to contact about plans for other areas.

Shelly Z.: So, as I-

Richard Yovanovich: That's Trimothy, right?

Sue Faulkner: Yeah. Trimothy. Trimothy Scott.

Richard Yovanovich: Trimothy Scott.

Shelly Z.: Trimothy Scott? Okay.

Sue Faulkner: Uh-huh. She's the manager of Transportation Planning.

Shelly Z.: Yeah, 'cause there's a whole-

Richard Yovanovich: Do you want her phone number?

Shelly Z.: Huh?

Richard Yovanovich: Do yo want her phone number?

Shelly Z.: Yeah. Grab my phone and put it right in.

Richard Yovanovich: It's, let me know when you're ready. This is Rich, by the way.

Shelly Z.: Phone number please.

Richard Yovanovich: It's 239-252-5832. So if you've got transportation lady questions, and if you want to verify anything we've said about how they do transportation studies, she's the woman in charge of that department.

Wayne Arnold: Yes, ma'am.

Speaker 11: I came tonight expecting to see, um, diagrams of where the buildings would be placed and what the buildings would look like. So are you saying you're not to that point yet, or did you not bring that, and-

Wayne Arnold: We're not to that point yet, ma'am. The, David's group, they've been talking to different multi-family apartment rental folks, but I've not seen a plan. I've not seen any architectural related to the project.

Speaker 11: Are you going to have another meeting then at that point? Because this seems a little premature then even if you're not to that point?

David G.: No, uh, you know the pur-purpose of zoning entitlement is to just, is to set up the guidelines by which all development has to, that occurs within there, has to abide by. So you get into things like setbacks, you get into things about height. Um, you get into allowable square footages and stuff like that. Then you go into the, say the development plan process whereby the county, Collier County's Land Development Code then, you know, kind of dictates a lot of different things. Architectural, landscape, all this other-

Speaker 11: Right.

David G.: Kind of stuff. So it's not something that we ever get into the detail, uh, at the PUD or zoning process, so ... So it's not something that ... We've done sight line studies to show kind of how it looks from Northgate. Uh, and, uh, with them being set back and stuff like that. But, other than that, no, we don't have any detail. Again, we don't have any plans right now. As far as moving forward, so how would we have any detail?

Speaker 11: But the county has approved this? That's what you're saying.

Wayne Arnold: No

Sue Faulkner: No.

Richard Yovanovich: We're going through the process.

Wayne Arnold: We're going through the process.

Speaker 11: Oh, okay. Well, that's what I thought it was and then, then I was thinking it wasn't that. Okay. Thank you.

Wayne Arnold: Yes ma'am.

Meryl O.: Meryl [Ozey 01:02:46]. Are you posing, are you thinking that you'll have different sized apartment buildings, uh, apartments, like two bedroom and one-

David G.: Yes, it'll be a mixed. David Genson. It'll be a mix of one, two and three. Primarily, mostly two bedroom units is what you see in a mix.

Meryl O.: And the average square footage?

Wayne Arnold: Well, our minimum in the PUD proposal is 700 square feet.

Meryl O.: Okay.

Wayne Arnold: It's a pretty common number for apartment complexes in the county. It's the minimum number. Yes, ma'am. We haven't heard from you yet.

Slava S.: My name is Slava [Struvenyuk 01:03:23] and I live in Pine Ridge Estates. Um, several comments. One is, uh, the gentleman's comment that, uh, we are going to get traffic coming through, cutting across Pine Ridge Estates. I, uh, I think that with all the money that will be generated for the builder for this project and for the county, something should be done to prevent that. Uh, there should ... Signs should be posted or something else, whatever is available to the county.

Slava S.: I think we should be meeting with county officials in, um, in discussing all our concerns not just the builders but also with the county. Uh, signs should be posted in the various exit points. Uh, for example, maybe out of the church complex or other complexes, uh, right turns must yield to U-turns. That's the law here. Very few people know because people come here seasonally and they don't know it. And that's someth- and that's a problem for us.

Richard Yovanovich: Stop means stop. Nobody stops.

Slava S.: Right. Right turns must yield to U-turns. U-turn has the right of way. And so a lot of people don't know that and that-that can cause accidents. And so, uh, I don't know how to approach this, but I think maybe we should be meeting with county officials with our concerns also.

Slava S.: And something, with all the money being generated, I don't think we should accept things like, "Well you're going to get traffic coming through anyway." I don't think we should. Why don't we stand up and say, "No. Do something about it. Do something to prevent traffic coming across private residential areas."

Sue Faulkner: That's why you should go to the June and July meetings.

Slava S.: Yes. Where are they going to be?

Slava S.: Can somebody give me information? That's where I'm lost.

Richard Yovanovich: You-you-you do. Rich Yovanovich for the record. You do understand that the streets in Pine Ridge are public streets?

Slava S.: Yes.

Richard Yovanovich: They're paid for by the county. They're maintained by the county.

Slava S.: But not at-

Richard Yovanovich: There's no way, there's no you're going to be able to prevent somebody that lives in another community from driving through and using Center Street if they want to, to cut around that intersection. Just not going to happen. We just have to put up with that now, and remember they've changed some things. You can't use Center all the way across anymore, they've cut off Orange Blossom, so they've taken some pretty significant steps to cut down that cut through traffic, but we're gonna continue to have that. They're public roads.

Wayne Arnold: Caroline.

Caroline M.: Yay. Just a-a couple of points. First of all, I think we can all agree that traffic pattern for residential is different to a traffic pattern for commercial. Correct?

Richard Yovanovich: I don't think so.

David G.: Why?

Wayne Arnold: I don't know that we can all agree to that.

Caroline M.: Because people come home late from work, they go off early to work, before the shops are open. I mean, is that not obv-

David G.: A car is a car.

Caroline M.: No, no. I know a car is a car. But the pattern is going to be different, I think that's part of the thing that's going to be an impact. However, I have a few other questions that I, because we certainly covered the traffic one way or another.

Caroline M.: Um, on the height, at the previous neighborhood information meeting you had said you were going to ask for a variance on the height so that you could put five stories up because you had to take it up to 60 feet or something.

Caroline M.: Don't look at me askance because I distinctly remember it.

Wayne Arnold: That's not a variance. We set our own development standard on a PUD, it's not a deviation or a variance.

Caroline M.: So what is the height restriction, because I believe that I understood that it was going to be a special request for the height?

Wayne Arnold: We added in our conference plan amendment language that the buildings can be a maximum of four stories over parking.

Caroline M.: So what is the county standard? What is the previously agreed height at that location.

Wayne Arnold: Rich already read those.

Caroline M.: So then that's what I didn't understand.

Wayne Arnold: [crosstalk 01:07:37] ... it's-

Caroline M.: No, no. I wrote it down. I wrote it down. So right now, the previously agreed height at that location is 40 foot for retail and 50 foot for office, correct?

Wayne Arnold: With architectural embellishments, going up to 60 feet.

Caroline M.: With, okay, I don't think you mentioned that part or I would have written it down. But, anyway-

Wayne Arnold: It's in the PUD.

Caroline M.: So you didn't mention it previously, you mentioned it last time. Okay. So my question is, how do we in Pine Ridge, um, arrange the same sight line survey across Goodlette-Frank Road that presumably Northgate arranged for you to do across Pine Ridge Road?

Caroline M.: Because there are definitely, as Chris, who has now had to leave, as Chris mentioned, there are houses down Goodlette-Frank Road that back on to it there, two stories high. They are going to see these buildings. So is it possible for us to get the same sight line survey? I would imagine the answer is yes. How do we go about doing that?

Richard Yovanovich: Well the answer is, do we have-

David G.: What?

Richard Yovanovich: They want a sight line analysis along-

Wayne Arnold: Sure. Let's do it. That's easy to do.

Caroline M.: Because presumably you did it across Pine Ridge Road. But you didn't do it across Goodlette because we didn't ask for it. I didn't think that we-

Richard Yovanovich: Correct. Nobody asked for it. We're happy to do it.

Caroline M.: Right, well.

Wayne Arnold: Just accept that you did [crosstalk 01:08:45]-

Caroline M.: Do we have to write something down to say that we would like it? Or ..

Wayne Arnold: One at a time please. Well it's being recorded. We have to turn this neighborhood recording into the county within two days and I'm sure that, uh both Sue and Tim are taking notes, so-

Caroline M.: That would be very helpful.

James P.: What's the ... James [Payor 01:09:06], Pine Ridge. What's the status of the PUD? Are you just beginning this? Is this part of the what you-

Wayne Arnold: This is-

James P.: Take to the county, or is the county, does the county sign go off on any of your assumptions and plans?

David G.: The county ... This is David Genson. The county hearing that we had previously wasn't agreeing to transmit our, uh, Growth Management Plan Amendment to the state for their review, which Wayne said has come back with no conflicts.

David G.: Now, in the parallel process we've been running with, we've been taking the PUD. And it is now going both the Growth Management Plan Amendment and the PUD Amendment are being heard at the July meeting, uh, I'm sorry, June meeting for the Planning Commission and then the July 10th meeting at the Board of County Commissioners. So there's nothing that's been approved yet other than approving that to transmit it to the state, it's already come back, so ...

Wayne Arnold: So the Planning Commission will make a recommendation at its hearing date to the Board of County Commissioners. And the Board of County Commissioners, presumably on June 10th will take a vote. And it'll be four out of five votes on the County Commission to pass it and adopt the changes we're proposing.

Sharon: Lindsay M.?

Speaker 12: You had different dates before. Can you reiterate what the two days that, before someone said, well June 21st and July 11th. Can we get the exact dates and some proximate guess-timates.

Wayne Arnold: It is June 21st for the Planning Commission and June 10th-

Sharon: July.

David G.: July.

Richard Yovanovich: July.

Parker: July.

Wayne Arnold: Sorry, July 10th for the County Commission.

Speaker 13: And where will that be held?

Wayne Arnold: They're held at the County Commission Chambers for the County Commission meeting. And I believe the Planning Commission meeting is going to be held at the Horseshoe Drive Complex at 2800 North Horseshoe Drive.

Lindsay M.: Is the staff [inaudible 01:10:50]?

Speaker 13: That's the 21st, the 21st.

Wayne Arnold: That's the correct. The 21st meeting will be held at the Horseshoe Drive Complex.

Speaker 14: What time?

Wayne Arnold: Um, all those meetings begin at nine AM.

Speaker 14: Board meeting will be at the main complex on [Airport 01:11:02]?

Wayne Arnold: That's correct. Yes.

Speaker 48: Uh, this, the issue's besides the traffic, of course is a big one, but last year when we had the hurricane, we had a lot of the, uh, facilities that were, uh, taxed to their limit. The sewers went down because they didn't have generators on the pumper stations. The traffic was unbearable. A lot of people lost electricity, and so you had long lines at the gas stations to get gas for generators. I mean, all these different things that were going wrong, traffic lights were not operating.

Speaker 48: And now, you know, and it's not just this particular project but all these projects, little by little by little adding in more people to an already overtaxed system. You know, the people can't get access to the beach, [inaudible 01:11:52] is everything. At what point do you just end it. Where's the sewage going to go to that's coming out of there? We're at the, we're at the limits of the water supply.

Speaker 48: I mean, all these different things, you keep adding in all of these different projects and all, at some point we gotta take care of what's already here and the systems that we already have and then bring them up to-to the capacity that's needed.

Caroline M.: Caroline Matino from Pine Ridge. Water is a concern for us, don't get that wrong. Because it, most of Pine Ridge is still on, and 400 houses are still on well water. And-and that's not going to change anytime soon, so we are concerned about the wells that we build.

Richard Yovanovich: We-we draw water from [inaudible 01:12:36] County when they get central utility and they go through a totally different aquifer-

David G.: Right.

Richard Yovanovich: From the water system we draw from in Pine Ridge. It's going to have no impact on the water.

Wayne Arnold: It looks like the crowd's diminishing. Ma'am, you haven't asked a question.

Tam S.: Yeah, my name is Tam Schneider and I have two homes. One in Northgate and one in Country Club in Naples. And I'm not familiar with the building codes, but is the building codes different in The Moorings Park, you know the The Moorings, the retirement center that it is on this property we're talking about?

Wayne Arnold: Mm. There may be somewhat different, but everybody lives under the Florida Building Code ultimately, and ...

Tam S.: Well, I-I-I was not, I mean I understand you go into a property, you have a right to do with it as you please. But, the traffic ... everybody, we've covered that, however my piece of property in Country Club in Naples backs up to the new tall building in The Moorings. And anybody, it's five or six stories, I'm not exactly sure, but it's an obnoxious building, it's lit 24 hours a day and I'm concerned that we're going to have the same thing. With this, it literally glows. I mean, it would probably, the light would probably come across the street to Northgate Village and I'm wondering if that was a special, um, assessment or agreement with the county. And is that something different than what would be here?

Richard Yovanovich: To the ... For the record, Rich Yovanovich. I-I don't ... First of all, Moorings Park is within the city. I don't know if there are different building code requirements for senior housing versus not-senior housing as far as lighting goes. I don't know the answer to that, uh, but, um, so I don't know why that building is, and I don't even know which building it is in Moorings Park. Is it- is it-

Tam S.: It's the newest building. Now the other buildings are not, obnoxious as this new one is. And I know that there was a code variation for that building, but, um, it's an eyesore at night.

Wayne Arnold: Okay. Any other questions? Areas we haven't touched on? Yes, ma'am.

Lindsay M.: One quick question. Um, once you find out what the net developable are for the residential component will be, we kind of get a net density, can you think of a, like they do apartment complexes similar development that we can look at and see okay this is what a five story apartment building of this luxury quality looks like.

Wayne Arnold: We can try, but I'll just tell you-

Lindsay M.: In my mind, I'm thinking the Livingston and Goldengate, the one that's in the southwest corner-

Wayne Arnold: Market Run?

Lindsay M.: Yeah, is that what we're talking?

Wayne Arnold: Well, those buildings, I don't ... they had integrated parking and garages into those buildings. I don't think they're built over a leveled parking per se.

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Wayne Arnold: Um, David you didn't all directly do that project, at Market Run, but you may know more about it than I do. But, but the county looks at gross densities, they don't look at net.

Lindsay M.: I understand that, but-

Wayne Arnold: Because if they did that, any high rise in Pelican Bay, you know, 200 units on a two acre piece of property-

Lindsay M.: The affective feel of being in that community, I see the open space, there's, to the north there's a preserve area, there's a, it doesn't look like there's going to be a lot integrated throughout because you've already met your preserve areas in those two areas probably. So, the, when I drive by that, is it going to feel like, wall of building, dense, no open space, five stories high? That's what I want to know.

Wayne Arnold: Okay. And that's a little different to me that the density question because to me the density is a math equation-

Lindsay M.: But I'm asking for a net density, not an overall gross.

Wayne Arnold: That I can make, because I can make a six unit breaker project look really horrible or I can make it look really great.

Lindsay M.: Right. But I'm saying I'm, what you're going to develop the apartment on is going to be basically separately entities. What's the density?

Wayne Arnold: I don't know that we have an answer for you tonight.

Richard Yovanovich: I don't, we don't know, I would tell you if I, I don't have the exact acreage of those two parcels right now so I'm going to have to go to the net calculation.

Lindsay M.: Okay.

Richard Yovanovich: I wish, I know your question-

Lindsay M.: Yeah, yeah, okay.

Richard Yovanovich: I just don't know. I don't know.

Wayne Arnold: Anybody else? No. Okay. Then I'm gonna adjourn the meeting. Looking forward
to seeing anybody who wants to, at the Planning Commission and the Board.