



Growth Management Department
Zoning Division
Comprehensive Planning Section

MEMORANDUM

To: Nancy Gundlach, AICP, PLA # 1244, Principal Planner, Zoning Services Section

From: Sue Faulkner, Principal Planner, Comprehensive Planning Section

Date: September 21, 2017

Subject: *Future Land Use Element (FLUE) Consistency Review*

APPLICATION NUMBER: PUDA-20160002496 Rev: 1

APPLICATION NAME: Fiddler's Creek - Marco Shores (PUDA)

REQUEST: This application requests an amendment to the Marco Shores/Fiddler's Creek Planned Unit Development (PUD), approved via Ordinance #84-42 and as most recently amended via Ordinance #00-84, to:

- Replace Exhibit 'FC-A1' with updated PUD Master Plan.
- Add two new project access points on US 41 to the Master Plan.
- Add back Sections 1.4, 1.5, and 1.6, which had been left out of the last three amendments (Ord. #98-13, Ord. #98-38, and Ord. # 00-84)
- Add two additional sites of Business/Commercial on the Master Plan.
- Amend Section 1.4 to modify total acres in the entire Marco Shores PUD from 2,133 to 4,439.31-acres (to reflect previous acreage additions).
- Amend Section 2.3 (D) the land use summary for Fiddler's Creek (Unit 30) to reflect updates to the acres and the land use categories.
- Create two tables – one for Fiddler's Creek of the PUD and one for all other areas of the PUD.
- Amend Section 3.4 (9) to remove specific parcel locations for Group Care Family Care to be limited to locations shown on Exhibit "FC-A1".
- Amend Section 6.2 to add two additional land uses in the Business areas: (5) dwelling units, multi-family and (17) self-storage inside.
- Amend Section 6.8 to increase the total acreage for Business/Commercial land use from 33.6-acres to 55-acres. The maximum floor area for business/commercial uses remains at 325,000 square feet.
- Amend Section 11.4 to amend text from 'will' to 'shall' in reference to golf courses, which have not been developed.

LOCATION: The ±3,932-acre Unit 30 portion of the Marco Shores/Fiddler's Creek PUD (subject property) is located approximately 2.8 miles south of Tamiami Trail East (US 41) and on the east side of Collier Blvd. (SR 951), at the intersection of Fiddler's Creek Parkway and Collier Blvd., extending east approximately 2.9 miles to the intersection of Tamiami Trail East (US 41) and Sandpiper Drive, in Section 11, 13, 14, 15, 18, 19, 21, 22, 23, 24, 26, 29, and 33, Township 51 South, Range 27 East; and Sections 13, 14, 15, 21, 22, 23, 24, 27, and 28, Township 51 South, Range 26 East.

COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING COMMENTS: The subject property is limited to the Unit 30 portion of the Marco Shores/Fiddler’s Creek PUD, otherwise known as Fiddler’s Creek. This property is partially designated Urban, Urban Mixed-Use District, Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict (approximately 40%), partially Urban Residential Fringe Subdistrict (approximately 25%) and partially Rural Fringe Mixed Use Neutral Land (approximately 35%), and is completely within the Coastal High Hazard Area (CHHA) as depicted on the Future Land Use Map of the Growth Management Plan. According to the Future Land Use Element (FLUE), the Urban Mixed-Use District is intended to accommodate a variety of residential and non-residential land uses, including mixed-use developments such as Planned Unit Developments.

The purpose of the Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict is to provide transitional densities between the Conservation designated area (primarily located to the south of the Subdistrict) and the remainder of the Urban designated area (primarily located to the north of the Subdistrict). This Subdistrict allows a maximum of 4 dwelling units per acre, except as allowed in the Density Rating System to accommodate Affordable Housing, Transfers of Development Rights, certain FLUE Policies under Objective 5, and as provided in the Bayshore Gateway Redevelopment Overlay. Because the project lies within the CHHA, it is subject to a density reduction of 1 DU/A, yielding an eligible density of 3 DU/A.

The purpose of the Urban Residential Fringe Subdistrict is to provide transitional densities between the Urban Designated Area and the Agricultural/Rural Area. This Subdistrict allows a maximum of 1.5 dwelling units per acre.

The Rural Fringe Mixed Use District (RFMUD) provides a transition between the Urban and Estates Designated lands and between the Urban and Agricultural/Rural and Conservation designated lands farther to the east. Neutral Lands have been identified for limited semi-rural residential development. The Neutral Lands allow a maximum of 1 dwelling unit per 5 acres.

The total number of acres in Unit 30 (Fiddler’s Creek) are 3,922. This petition is proposing a total of 55-acres of commercial/office land uses. Commercial/office land use acres are not included in the total acres for density calculations; therefore, the total number of acres for density calculations is 3,877 acres ($3,932 - 55 = 3,877$ acres). The table below uses 3,877 acres in the density calculations.

The table below shows the estimated percentages of the total acres for each designation within Unit 30 (Fiddler’s Creek). It also shows the eligible number of dwelling units (DUs) rounded to the nearest whole unit by designation. If the developer were to seek zoning approval for the maximum number of DUs allowed in each designation, the total number of units could be 6,377 DUs, which is more than the previously approved and currently proposed 6,000 DUs.

FLUE Designation	Density Allowance	Unit 30 (Fiddler’s Creek) Estimated % of Total Acres by Designation	# of Eligible Dwelling Units (rounded to nearest whole unit)
Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict	3 DU/A	40% of 3877 = 1550.8 acres	$= 1550.8 * 3 = 4,652$ DUs
Urban Residential Fringe Subdistrict	1.5 DU/A	25% of 3877 = 969.25 acres	$= 969.25 * 1.5 = 1,454$ DUs
Rural Fringe MU District - Neutral Lands	1 DU/ 5-acres	35% of 3877 = 1356.95 acres	$= 1357/5 = 271$ DUs
Total Eligible DUs for All Designations			$= 6,377$ DUs which is an average of 1.64 DU/A

Currently Unit 30 (Fiddler’s Creek) of the Marco Shores/Fiddler’s Creek PUD has an approved density of 1.53 dwelling units per acre via Ordinance #00-84 – which included 33.6-acres of commercial/office land uses. The PUD includes both residential and commercial/office land uses; however, density calculations should not include the acres that are commercial/office land uses. The petition is proposing a total of 55-acres of commercial/office land uses. The table below shows the density with and without the exclusion of the commercial/office land use acres for Unit 30 (Fiddler’s Creek). Since the table above showed that this PUD is eligible for a maximum of 7,928 dwelling units (approximately 2 DU/A) and the proposed density is 6,000 dwelling units (approximately 1.55 DU/A), the proposed density is consistent with the FLUE.

Total Acres With Commercial/Office	Total Acres Without 55-acres of Proposed Commercial/Office	Maximum # of Residential Units	Density Calculation
±3,932		6,000	= 6000/3932 = 1.53
	±3,877	6,000	= 6000/3877 = 1.55

The petition is proposing an increase from 33.6-acres to 55-acres of commercial/office land uses with two additional uses within these acres: indoor self-storage and to permit multi-family DUs. The application states that although this petition proposes to increase the number of commercial/office acres, the petition is proposing that the total number of square feet will remain unchanged at 325,000 square feet. The proposed Master Plan shows three of the commercial/office land uses areas will lie within Urban Coastal Fringe Subdistrict, which is part of the Urban Mixed Use District and allows for both residential and non-residential uses; the existing site on US 41 remains, but is reconfigured, and the existing site on Collier Blvd. is both reduced in size and a portion is split off and shifted to the south. The fourth commercial/office land use area shown on the proposed Master Plan shows a small portion lies within the Urban Residential Fringe Subdistrict and the majority lies with the Rural Fringe Mixed Use District – Neutral Lands; this is a new commercial tract. The Urban Residential Fringe Subdistrict is also a part of the Urban Mixed Use District which allows for both residential and non-residential uses. The new commercial/office lands will be addressed in the companion Growth Management Plan Amendment (GMPA). The RFMUD – Neutral Lands subsection of the FLUE already discusses Fiddler’s Creek residential density, specifically. The GMPA must be adopted and become effective prior to or concurrent with the approval of this PUDA petition.

Select *FLUE Policies* are given below, followed with **[bracketed staff analysis]**.

FLUE Policy 5.4 states: “*New developments shall be compatible with, and complementary to, the surrounding land uses, as set forth in the Land Development Code (Ordinance 04-41, adopted June 22, 2004 and effective October 18, 2004, as amended).*” **[It is the responsibility of the Zoning Services staff, as part of their review of the petition in its entirety, to perform the compatibility analysis.]**

FLUE Policy 7.1 states: “*The County shall encourage developers and property owners to connect their properties to fronting collector and arterial roads, except where no such connection can be made without violating intersection spacing requirements of the Land Development Code.* **[Fiddler’s Creek Master Plan (Exhibit FC-A1) - indicate two (2) accesses connecting the subject property with Collier Blvd. (SR 951) to the west, classified as a minor arterial roadway. The Master Plan also indicates two (2) accesses connecting the subject property with Tamiami Trail East (US 41), an “other” principal arterial roadway.**

FLUE Policy 7.2

The County shall encourage internal accesses or loop roads in an effort to help reduce vehicle congestion on nearby collector and arterial roads and minimize the need for traffic signals. **[Fiddler’s Creek Master Plan (Exhibit FC-A1) shows interconnected roadways to allow for traffic circulation within the development.]**

FLUE Policy 7.3

All new and existing developments shall be encouraged to connect their local streets and their interconnection points with adjoining neighborhoods or other developments regardless of land use type. The interconnection of local streets between developments is also addressed in Policy 9.3 of the Transportation Element. [Fiddler's Creek's road network is significantly developed and staff believes establishing new interconnections with adjoining neighborhoods would not be feasible. There are conservation lands to the south preventing any interconnection. Tamiami Trail East (US 41) adjoins a large portion of the northern border. Undeveloped land lies to the east, designated RFMUD Neutral Lands and lying along Auto Ranch Road, and interconnections are not feasible at this time. There are two undeveloped lands and a mobile home community that lie north of Fiddlers Creek and are connected to Port Au Prince Dr. (most of which are separated by an intervening canal); interconnections are not feasible at this time.]

FLUE Policy 7.4

The County shall encourage new developments to provide walkable communities with a blend of densities, common open spaces, civic facilities and a range of housing prices and types. [The proposed Fiddler's Creek Master Plan indicates open space, as well as community recreational amenities. This development is significantly developed with sidewalks throughout much of the roadways creating a walkable community. There is a blend of densities and types of housing. There is a community center which serves as a civic facility.]

Based upon the above analysis, staff concludes the proposed Planned Unit Development Amendment may NOT be deemed consistent with the Future Land Use Element (FLUE). However, the petition may be deemed consistent, if the companion Growth Management Plan Amendment (GMPA) is adopted and becomes effective. The PUDA Ordinance needs to contain an effective date linked to the effective date of the companion GMPA.

PETITION ON CITYVIEW

cc: Mike Bosi, AICP, Director, Zoning Division
David Weeks, AICP, Growth Management Manager, Zoning Division, Comprehensive Planning Section
Ray Bellows, Manager, Zoning Services Section
[PUDA-PL2016-2496 Fiddler's Creek PUD R1.docx](#)